



www.lsc.ohio.gov

OHIO LEGISLATIVE SERVICE COMMISSION

Office of Research
and Drafting

Legislative Budget
Office

H.B 606
133rd General Assembly

Bill Analysis

[Click here for H.B. 606's Fiscal Note](#)

Version: As Reported by Senate Judiciary

CORRECTED VERSION

Primary Sponsor: Rep. Grendell

Erika Kramer, Attorney
Aida S. Montano, Research Analyst

SUMMARY

Temporary civil immunity for health care providers

- Grants temporary qualified immunity to specified health care providers who provide health care services or emergency services during a declared disaster or emergency as described below.
- Grants immunity from tort liability and professional discipline for such services provided as a result of and in response to a disaster or emergency that results in injury, death, or loss allegedly resulting from (1) actions or omissions in the provision, withholding, or withdrawal of those services, (2) decisions related to the provision, withholding, or withdrawal of those services, and (3) compliance with an executive order or director's order.
- Grants immunity from tort liability and professional discipline for injury, death, or loss that allegedly resulted because a health care provider was unable to treat a person, including the inability to perform any elective procedure, due to an executive or director's order or a local health order issued in relation to an epidemic or pandemic disease or other public health emergency.

Exceptions to immunity

- Excludes from immunity in tort actions conduct that constitutes a reckless disregard of the consequences or intentional or willful or wanton misconduct on the part of the person against whom the action is brought.
- Excludes from immunity in professional disciplinary actions conduct that constitutes gross negligence.

- Excludes from immunity conduct outside the skills, education, or training of the health care provider, unless undertaken in good faith and in response to a lack of resources caused by a disaster or emergency.

Limitations

- Provides that the immunity does not create a new cause of action or substantive legal right against a health care provider or affect any immunities or responsibilities of a health care provider.
- Specifies that if immunity does not apply, no class action can be brought against a health care provider for the above conduct undertaken during a disaster or emergency.
- Limits the bill's provisions regarding immunity for health care providers to March 9, 2020, through December 31, 2020.

General immunity

- In uncodified law, generally prevents bringing a civil action for injury, death, or loss to person or property against any person if the cause of action on which the action is based, in whole or in part, is that the injury, death, or loss is caused by the exposure to, or the transmission or contraction of, "MERS-CoV," "SARS-CoV," or "SARS-CoV-2," or any mutation thereof.
- Provides that the above immunity does not apply if it is established that the exposure to, or the transmission or contraction of, any of those viruses or mutations was by reckless conduct or intentional misconduct or willful or wanton misconduct of the person against whom the action is brought.
- Generally defines "reckless conduct" as conduct by which, with heedless indifference to the consequences, the person disregards a substantial and unjustifiable risk that such conduct:
 - Is likely to cause an exposure to, or a transmission or contraction of, MERS-CoV, SARS-CoV, or SARS-CoV-2, or any mutation thereof, or
 - Is likely to be of a nature that results in an exposure to, or a transmission or contraction of, any of those viruses or mutations.
- Provides that if general immunity does not apply, no class action can be brought against any person alleging liability for damages for injury, death, or loss to person or property based on the specified cause of action.
- Specifies that a government order, recommendation, or guideline does not create a duty of care on a person that may be enforced in a cause of action or that may create a new cause of action or substantive right against any person regarding the matters in the government order, recommendation, or guideline.
- Provides that the general immunity provisions apply from March 9, 2020, through December 31, 2020.

Legislative findings and statement of intent

- Based on enumerated findings, declares the General Assembly’s intent that executive branch orders and recommendations do not create new legal duties for purposes of tort liability and are presumed to be (1) irrelevant to the existence or breach of a duty and (2) inadmissible in tort actions to establish the existence or breach of a duty.

Other

- Specifies that the bill’s provisions apply from the date of the Governor’s Executive Order, 2020-01D, issued on March 9, 2020, declaring a state of emergency due to COVID-19, through December 31, 2020.
- Specifies that if any provision of the bill is found invalid, that invalidity does not affect other provisions of the bill that can be given effect without the invalid provision.
- Declares an emergency.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Qualified immunity for health care providers in a disaster or emergency	4
Inability to provide services	5
Covered providers	5
Duration of immunity	6
Exceptions to immunity	6
Reckless disregard or intentional misconduct or willful or wanton misconduct	6
Gross negligence	7
Outside skills, education, and training	7
Interaction with other legal rights and duties	7
Class action prohibition	7
Application	7
General qualified immunity	8
Class action prohibition	8
Effect of government order	8
Definitions	8
Applicability	9
Legislative findings and statement of intent	9
Application to existing disasters	10
Severability clause	10

DETAILED ANALYSIS

Qualified immunity for health care providers in a disaster or emergency

The bill enacts a new uncodified section granting temporary qualified civil immunity for health care providers providing health care services during a declared disaster or emergency. Under the bill, a health care provider who provides health care services, emergency medical services, first-aid treatment, or other emergency professional care, including providing any medication or medical equipment or product, as a result of or in response to a disaster or emergency is not subject to professional disciplinary action and is not liable in a tort action to any person or government agency for injury, death, or loss to person or property arising from any of the following:

- An act or omission of the health care provider in the provision, withholding, or withdrawal of those services;
- Any decision related to providing, withholding, or withdrawing those services;
- Compliance with an executive order or director's order issued during and in response to the disaster or emergency.¹

The bill defines "disaster" as any occurrence of widespread personal injury or loss of life that results from any natural or technological phenomenon or act of a human, or an epidemic and is declared to be a disaster by the federal government, the state government, or a political subdivision of Ohio.² An "emergency" is any period during which the Congress, the Governor, a board of county commissioners, a board of township trustees, or a mayor or city manager in Ohio has declared or proclaimed that an emergency exists.³

For purposes of the immunity, "health care services" mean services rendered by a health care provider for the diagnosis, prevention, treatment, cure, or relief of a health care condition, illness, injury, or disease (including the provision of any medication, medical equipment, or other medical product). It also includes personal care services (assisting with activities of daily living and self-administration of medication and preparing special diets) and experimental treatments.⁴ Under the bill, a tort action is a civil action for injury, death, or loss to person or property, including a medical claim, and includes claims arising under resident or patient bills of rights and contractual claims arising out of statutory or regulatory requirements applicable to health care providers.⁵

¹ Section 1(B)(1).

² Section 1(A)(10).

³ Section 1(A)(11) and R.C. 5502.21(C) and (F), not in the bill.

⁴ Section 1(A)(21); R.C. 3721.01, not in the bill.

⁵ Section 1(A)(46).

Inability to provide services

The bill further provides that a health care provider is not subject to professional discipline nor liable in a tort action for injury, death, or loss to person or property that allegedly arises because the provider was unable to treat, diagnose, or test a person for any illness, disease, or condition, including performing elective procedures, by an executive or director's order or an order of a local board of health issued in relation to an epidemic, pandemic, or other public health emergency.⁶

Covered providers

The bill grants immunity to the following individuals and entities:

- Advanced practice registered nurses, registered nurses, and licensed practical nurses;
- Pharmacists;
- Dentists and dental hygienists;
- Optometrists;
- Physicians;
- Physician assistants;
- Chiropractors;
- Physical therapists, occupational therapists, and athletic trainers;
- Speech language-pathologists and audiologists;
- Laboratory workers;
- Massage therapists;
- Respiratory care professionals;
- Direct support professionals (an individual employed by an agency to provide direct care to individuals with developmental disabilities);
- Behavioral health providers (providers of alcohol and drug addiction services, mental health services, or other behavioral health services, including chemical dependency counselors and prevention consultants and specialists, clinical counselors, professional counselors, social workers, marriage and family therapists, and psychologists);
- Emergency medical technicians (EMTs-basic, EMTs-I, and paramedics);
- Home health agencies;
- Hospice care programs;

⁶ Section 1(B)(4).

- Medicaid home and community-based services providers;
- Other health care workers who provide health-care related services to an individual under the direction of a health care professional with the authority to direct that worker's activities, including medical technicians, medical assistants, dental assistants, occupational therapy assistants, physical therapist assistants, orderlies, nurse aides, and any other similar individual;
- Facilities that provide health care services, including hospitals, inpatient, ambulatory, surgical, emergency care, urgent care, treatment, laboratory, adult day-care, residential care (commonly referred to as "assisted living"), residential treatment, long-term care (nursing homes, homes for the aging, residential facilities licensed by the Department of Mental Health and Addiction Services, nursing facilities, skilled nursing facilities, and intermediate care facilities for individuals with intellectual disabilities), or intermediate care facilities or facilities for individuals with developmental disabilities (including institutions for mental disease and residential facilities); physician's offices, developmental, diagnostic, or imaging centers; rehabilitation or therapeutic health settings; federally qualified health centers (FQHCs) and FQHC look-alikes; or modular field treatment facilities or alternative care sites designated for temporary use to provide medical services during a disaster or emergency; and
- Agents, board members, committee members, employees, employers, officers, or volunteers of a home health agency, hospice care program, Medicaid home and community-based services provider, or facility.⁷

Duration of immunity

The immunity described above applies to actions, omissions, decisions, or compliance by a health care provider as a result of or in response to a disaster or emergency and through the duration of the disaster or emergency.⁸

Exceptions to immunity

Reckless disregard or intentional misconduct or willful or wanton misconduct

In a tort action, the health care provider immunity granted under the bill does not apply to actions, omissions, decisions, or compliance that constitute a reckless disregard for the consequences so as to affect the life or health of a patient, or intentional misconduct or willful or wanton misconduct on the part of the person against whom the action is brought. For purposes of this provision, "reckless disregard" means conduct by which, with heedless indifference to the consequences, the health care provider disregards a substantial and unjustifiable risk that the health care provider's conduct is likely to cause, at the time health

⁷ Section 1(A).

⁸ Section 1(C)(5).

care or emergency services were rendered, an unreasonable risk of injury, death, or loss to person or property.⁹

Gross negligence

With regard to professional discipline, the immunity does not apply to actions, omissions, decisions, or compliance that constitutes gross negligence (a lack of care so great that it appears to be a conscious indifference to the rights of others).¹⁰

Outside skills, education, and training

The immunity does not apply in a tort or professional disciplinary action for actions that are outside the skills, education, or training of the health care provider, unless the provider undertakes the action in good faith and in response to a lack of resources caused by a disaster or emergency.¹¹

Interaction with other legal rights and duties

The bill provides that the immunity does not create a new cause of action or substantive legal right against a health care provider, affect any immunities established by another section of the Revised Code or at common law, or affect any legal responsibility of a health care provider to comply with any state law or administrative rule.¹²

Class action prohibition

If immunity does not apply, the bill prohibits a class action lawsuit from being brought against a health care provider if the lawsuit involves damages for injury, death, or loss to person or property involving the provision, withholding, or withdrawal of health care services, emergency medical services, first-aid treatment, or other emergency professional care, decisions related to those services or care, or compliance with an executive or director's order as a result of or in response to a disaster or emergency.¹³

Application

The bill clarifies that its provisions regarding immunity for health care providers apply to a health care provider's action, omission, decision, or compliance from the date of the Governor's Executive Order 2020-01D, declaring a state of emergency due to COVID-19, through December 31, 2020.¹⁴ During that period, these provisions supersede R.C. 2305.2311, which provides that a health care provider or EMT who provides emergency medical services, first-aid treatment, or other emergency professional care as a result of a disaster is not liable in

⁹ Section 1(A)(42) and (B)(2).

¹⁰ Section 1(A)(18) and (B)(3).

¹¹ Section 1(C)(3).

¹² Section 1(C)(1), (2), and (4).

¹³ Section 1(D).

¹⁴ Section 1(E).

a tort action for injury, death, or loss to person or property arising from the provider's or EMT's act or omission.¹⁵

General qualified immunity

The bill, in temporary uncodified law, prohibits bringing a civil action for damages for injury, death, or loss to person or property against any "person" if the cause of action on which the action is based, in whole or in part, is that the injury, death, or loss is caused by the exposure to, or the transmission or contraction of, "MERS-CoV," "SARS-CoV," or "SARS-CoV-2," or any mutation thereof, unless it is established that the exposure to, or the transmission or contraction of, any of those viruses or mutations was by "reckless conduct" or intentional misconduct or with willful or wanton misconduct of the person against whom the action is brought.¹⁶ See "**Definitions**" for definitions of the terms in quotation marks.

Class action prohibition

Under the bill, if the above immunity does not apply, no class action can be brought against any person alleging liability for damages for injury, death, or loss to person or property based on the specified cause of action.¹⁷

Effect of government order

Under the bill, a government order, recommendation, or guideline neither creates nor is to be construed as creating a duty of care upon any person that may be enforced in a cause of action or may create a new cause of action or substantive legal right against any person with respect to the matters contained in that order, recommendation, or guideline. A presumption exists that any such government order, recommendation, or guideline is not admissible as evidence that a duty of care, a new cause of action, or a substantive legal right has been established.¹⁸

Definitions

The bill defines the following terms:¹⁹

"**Person**" means an individual, corporation, business trust, estate, trust, partnership, and association as in continuing law, and also includes a school, a for-profit or nonprofit entity, a governmental entity, or a religious entity, or a "state institution of higher education."²⁰

"**MERS-CoV**" means the coronavirus that causes Middle East respiratory syndrome.

¹⁵ Section 1(E); R.C. 2305.2311, not in the bill.

¹⁶ Section 2(A).

¹⁷ Section 2(C).

¹⁸ Section 2(B).

¹⁹ Section 2(D).

²⁰ Section 2(D) and by reference to R.C. 1.59, not in the bill.

“**SARS-CoV**” means the coronavirus that causes severe acute respiratory syndrome.

“**SARS-CoV-2**” means the novel coronavirus that causes coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19).

“**Reckless conduct**” means conduct by which, with heedless indifference to the consequences, the person disregards a substantial and unjustifiable risk that the person’s conduct is likely to cause an exposure to, or a transmission or contraction of, MERS-CoV, SARS-CoV, or SARS-CoV-2, or any mutation thereof, or is likely to be of a nature that results in an exposure to, or a transmission or contraction of, any of those viruses or mutations. A person is reckless with respect to circumstances in relation to causing an exposure to, or a transmission or contraction of, MERS-CoV, SARS-CoV, or SARS-CoV-2, or any mutation thereof, when, with heedless indifference to the consequences, the person disregards a substantial and unjustifiable risk that such circumstances are likely to exist.

“**State institution of higher education**” means any of the 13 “state universities” under continuing law, and the Northeast Ohio Medical University, a community college, state community college, university branch established under R.C. Chapter 3355, or technical college.²¹

Applicability

The bill provides that the general qualified immunity provisions described above apply from the date of the Governor’s Executive Order 2020-01D, issued on March 9, 2020, declaring a state of emergency due to COVID-19, through December 31, 2020.²²

Legislative findings and statement of intent

The bill states that the General Assembly finds that:

1. It is aware that COVID-19 lawsuits numbering in the thousands are being filed across the country and Ohio business owners are unsure about what tort liability they may face.
2. It is a fact that recommendations about how to avoid a COVID-19 infection change frequently and are often not based on well-tested scientific information, including recommendations from the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention regarding whether members of the general public should wear masks. Ohio businesses need certainty and consistency to reopen.
3. It is aware that business and premise owners have not historically been required to keep members of the public from being exposed to airborne viruses, bacteria, and germs. In Ohio, it is the responsibility of individuals going into public places to avoid exposure to individuals who are sick. Individuals who decide to go into public places are responsible

²¹ Section 2(D) and by reference to R.C. 3345.011, not in the bill.

²² Section 2(E).

for taking steps the individual feels are necessary to avoid exposure to COVID-19, such as social distancing or wearing a mask.

4. The current COVID-19 health emergency is novel. Past opinions of the Ohio Supreme Court do not deal with COVID-19 or duties to protect the public from exposure in public places to airborne germs and viruses, and the Revised Code does not establish duties on businesses and premise owners to ensure that members of the public will not be exposed.
5. It has not delegated to the executive branch the authority to create new legal duties for businesses and premise owners. In Ohio's system of government, the General Assembly makes Ohio's laws, and the Executive Branch enforces those laws.

Based on these findings, the General Assembly declares its intent that orders and recommendations from the executive branch, from counties and local municipalities, from boards of health and other agencies, and from any federal government agency do not create any new legal duties for purposes of tort liability and are presumed to be (1) irrelevant to the issue of the existence or breach of a duty and (2) inadmissible at trial to establish proof of the existence or breach of a duty in tort actions.²³

Application to existing disasters

The bill applies to acts, omissions, conduct, decisions, or compliance from the date of the Governor's Executive Order, 2020-01D, issued on March 9, 2020, declaring a state of emergency due to COVID-19, through December 31, 2020.²⁴

Severability clause

The bill provides that if any provision of the act or the application thereof to any person or circumstance is held invalid, the invalidity does not affect other provisions or applications of the act that can be given effect without the invalid provision or application.²⁵

HISTORY

Action	Date
Introduced	04-10-20
Reported, H. Civil Justice	05-28-20
Passed House (84-9)	05-28-20
Reported S. Judiciary	06-30-20

H0606-RS-CORRECTED-133/ec

²³ Section 3.

²⁴ Section 4.

²⁵ Section 5.